

Materials for
PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW (252S)

VOLUME 4
(Topics 16 - 20)

March 1997

Professor Craig Scott
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

These Materials are sold at cost and
are not to be considered as published.
They are solely for the educational
use of students at the University of Toronto
or at other educational institutions
to whom the Materials
may also be sold at cost.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03344 2203

DORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

MAR 6 1996

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Materials for
PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW (252S)

VOLUME 4
(Topics 16 - 20)

March 1997

Professor Craig Scott
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

These Materials are sold at cost and
are not to be considered as published.
They are solely for the educational
use of students at the University of Toronto
or at other educational institutions
to whom the Materials
may also be sold at cost.



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/materialsforpubl04scot>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume 4

NOTE 1: The course will be taught using these Materials as well as Ian Brownlie, eds., Basic Documents in International Law, 4th ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995). A course reading list will indicate the provisions of instruments contained in Brownlie to be read in tandem with the readings contained in this volume and subsequent volumes.

NOTE 2: "K:#" refers to an extract or note from Kindred et al., International Law: Chiefly as Interpreted and Applied in Canada, 3rd ed. (1987)

"H:#" refers to an extract or note from Harris, Cases and Materials on International Law, 4th ed. (London: Sweet and Maxwell. 1991)

"HPSS:#" refers to an extract or note from Henkin, Pugh, Schachter and Smit, International Law: Cases and Materials, 2nd ed. (St. Paul, Minn.: West Publishing, 1987)

Topic 16:

CONSTITUTIONALISM, UNILATERALISM, AND THE USE OF FORCE (I)

Law as a Process of Legal Justification

Schachter, "The Nature and Process of Legal Development in International Society" 1

General Principles and Basic Documents

UN Definition of Aggression, 1974 @ K27 5

Comments by Canadian Delegation on
Definition of Aggression & Notes @ K30 7

Scott Chart, "UN Charter and the Use of Force" 10

The Leading Judicial Articulation of the Law on the Use of Force

Facts in the Nicaragua Case @ H:824 11

Nicaragua Case 11

Scott Chart, "Summary of Nicaragua Framework and Holdings" 36

Hargrove, "The Nicaragua Judgment and the Future of the Law of Force and Self-Defense" 37

The Aftermath in Nicaragua and El Salvador

Tacsan, <u>The Dynamics of International Law In Conflict Resolution</u>	41
Note on Elections and Compensation re. Nicaragua	44
Ian Johnstone, <u>Rights and Reconciliation: UN Strategies in El Salvador</u>	45
Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, <u>Concluding Observations: El Salvador</u>	55

A Question Left Open in the Nicaragua Case: Anticipatory Self-defence

<u>The Caroline Incident</u> & Notes (UK v US) @ K40	59
Schachter, "Self-Defense and the Rule of Law -- The Influence of Community Judgment"	60
Security Council Debate on Israeli Attack on Iraqi Nuclear Reactor @ K46	63
Security Council Resolution on the Israeli Attack & Notes @ K47	64
Canada, Legal Bureau, Dept. of External Affairs, Memorandum on Canada's position on preemptive strikes @ K48	65

What States Say versus What States Do, and the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes

Akehurst and D'Amato Exchange, Letters to the Editor	66
Steven Ratner, "The Gulf of Sidra Incident of 1981: The Lawfulness of Peaceful Aerial Engagements"	69
ASIL Special Working Committee on Maritime Claims	73

Topic 17:

CONSTITUTIONALISM, UNILATERALISM, AND THE USE OF FORCE (II)

The Role of the General Assembly and Security Council in Collective Security

Facts regarding the Anglo-French Invasion of Suez and Record of Debate in the House of Lords @ H:861-863	75
<u>Uniting for Peace Resolution</u> , 1950 (UN General Assembly), and Note on Peace-Keeping Forces @ H:891-894	77

<u>Certain Expenses of the United Nations Case @ H:897-907</u>	79
--	----

The Security Council's Response to Iraq's Invasion of Kuwait

Benvenisti, "Attempts to Annex Adjacent Regions: Kuwait, Western Sahara, and East Timor -- The Iraqi Occupation of Kuwait"	87
Summary of Resolutions 660-670 (1990)	88
United Nations Security Council Resolution 678 Concerning Iraqi Aggression [Nov. 29, 1990]	89
United Nations Security Council Resolution 687 Affirming Earlier Resolutions and Setting Forth Terms of Cease-fire [April 3, 1991]	90
United Nations Security Council Resolution 688 Concerning the Iraqi Civilian Population [April 5, 1991]	95
Map of Kurdish Area of Northern Iraq	96

Scholarly Debate Over Legality and Legitimacy of the Response to Iraq's Invasion

Schachter, "United Nations Law in the Gulf Conflict"	97
Weston, "Security Council Resolution 678 and Persian Gulf Decision Making: Precarious Legitimacy"	106
Caron, "Iraq and the Force of Law: Why Give a Shield of Immunity?"	113
Wood, <u>World Order and Double Standards: Peace and Security, 1990-1991</u> ("The Kuwait Invasion as Test Case")	115

The Continuation of the Conflict

Center for Economic and Social Rights, "Executive Summary" in <u>(UN)Sanctioned Suffering: A Human Rights Assessment of United Nations Sanctions on Iraq</u>	118
Graham, Fraser, "US launches second attack on Iraq" (Sept. 4, 1996)	120
Drew Fagan, "U.S. isolation weakens its hand" (Sept. 4, 1996)	121
Jeff Sallot, "'Sometimes we have to act alone,' U.S. says"	122

A Lawyer-Diplomat's Response to the Realist Critique

Martti Koskenniemi, "The Place of Law in Collective Security"	123
---	-----

Topic 18:
CONSTITUTIONALISM, UNILATERALISM, AND THE USE OF FORCE (III)

The Rescue of Nationals Abroad

"The Entebbe Raid" -- Security Council Debates & Notes @ K51 136

Humanitarian Intervention: Three Arguments Against Using Force to Protect Human Rights and Democracy

Brownlie, "Thoughts on Kind-Hearted Gunmen" 139

Walzer, "The Moral Standing of States: A Response to Four Critics" & Cox News, "Somalia fast becoming quagmire for U.S. forces" 141

Schachter, "The Legality of Pro-Democratic Invasion" 146

The Panama Invasion: Welcoming Democracy?

David Alberts, "The United States Invasion of Panama: Unilateral Military Intervention to Effectuate a Change in Government -- A Continuum of Lawfulness" 148

U.S. [Dept. of State] Digest, "Protection of Nationals - Deployment of U.S. Forces to Panama" 151

UN Security Council, "Letter Dated 20 December 1989 from the Permanent Representative of the United States of America to the United Nations Addressed to the President of the Security Council" 154

Secretary of State for External Affairs, News Release, "U.S. Action in Panama" 155

"Panama" in Canadian International Relations Chronicle 155

United Nations Security Council, Debates on the United States' Invasion of Panama, [Canada and Peru] 156

David Alberts, "The United States Invasion of Panama... -- International Appraisal" 158

David Alberts, "The United States Invasion of Panama...-- Author's Appraisal" 160

D'Amato, "The Invasion of Panama Was a Lawful Response to Tyranny" 162

Craig Scott, "Grenada, Nicaragua and Panama: Tracking Force-for-Democracy Discourse in the 1980s"	165
Sofaer, "The Legality of the United States Action in Panama"	172
Henkin, "The Invasion of Panama Under International Law: A Gross Violation"	174

Panama as Precedent?

Hargrove, "Intervention by Invitation and the Politics of the New World Order"	177
AP, "Opposition mounts against Mobutu: Main rival urges military intervention in Zaire"	179

Haiti and Resolution 940: The Panama Paradigm Goes Collective?

Damrosch, "Recent Security Council Actions Concerning Internal Conflicts"	180
Carothers, "Empirical Perspectives on the Emerging Norm of Democracy in International Law"	181
Carothers, "ASIL and Carnegie Present Program on Haiti"	182
Gordon and Schmitt, "U.S. fears Haitian trap"	183
Snow, "Many Haitians favour invasion"	184
Jehl, "Clinton Seeks U.N. Approval of any Plan to Invade Haiti"	185
Lyons, "U.N. Authorizes Invasion of Haiti to be Led by U.S."	186
[Text of Resolution 940] "The U.N. Resolution Clearing the Way for an Invasion of Haiti"	187
HIB, "Haitians Debate the U.S. Occupation"	188

Topic 19:

COMMUNICATION AND NORMATIVE PROCESS IN THE NUCLEAR AGE (I)

Atmospheric Nuclear Testing and Custom: Two Classical Accounts

Myres McDougal, "The Hydrogen Bomb Tests and the International Law of the Sea"	189
Ian MacGibbon, "Customary International Law and Acquiescence" @ K:177	194

The Nuclear Test Cases and Unilateral Obligations

<u>Treaty Banning Nuclear Weapons Tests in the Atmosphere, in Outer Space and Under Water</u> (1963)	195
<u>Nuclear Tests Case #1</u> [1974] (Australia v France; New Zealand v. France) @ K116	196
View of the Canadian Dept. of External Affairs on Unilateral Obligations @ K118	197
Reisman, "International Lawmaking: A Process of Communication"	198
<u>Nuclear Tests Case #2</u> [1995] (New Zealand v France)	207

Nuclear Non-Proliferation, Interpretive Communities, and the Horizontality of Treaty Interpretation

<u>Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons</u> , 1968	213
Johnstone, "Treaty Interpretation: The Authority of Interpretive Communities"	216

Recent Developments

Nwogugu, "1995 NPT Review and Extension Conference: An Appraisal"	236
AFP, Reuter, "Beijing warns against 'unequal' N-ban treaty"	245
Dept. of Foreign Affairs, <u>Some Examples of Current Issues of International Law of Particular Importance to Canada</u> -- "Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty"	246

Topic 20:

COMMUNICATION AND NORMATIVE PROCESS IN THE NUCLEAR AGE (II)

Rules, Process, and Argument

Higgins, "The Nature and Function of International Law"	247
Henry Steiner, "International Law, Doctrine and Schools of Thought in the Twentieth Century"	252

General Assembly and UN Conference Resolutions on Nuclear Weapons Use and the Environment

Ian Brownlie, <u>Principles of Public International Law</u>	255
---	-----

UN General Assembly Res. 1653 (XVI), <u>Declaration on Banning of Nuclear Weapons</u> .	256
UN General Assembly Res. 1665 (XVI), <u>Prevention of Wider Dissemination of Nuclear Weapons</u>	256
<u>Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment</u> [the Stockholm Declaration], 1972, Principles 1, 2, 6, 7, 21, 22, 26	257
<u>Rio Declaration on Environment and Development</u> , 1992, Principles 1, 2, 13, 15, 24	258

The I.C.J. Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion

<u>Advisory Opinion on the Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons</u>	259
The Opinion of the Court	259
Declaration of Judge Shi Jiuyong	266
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Oda	267
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Weeramantry	273
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Schwebel	279
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Higgins	286
Declaration of Judge Vereshcheten	288

